

[IJSCM] Submission Acknowledgement**International Journal of Supply Chain Management** <mamunhabib@gmail.com>

Sat, Apr 25, 2020 at 11:19 AM

To: **Ahmad Hidayat Sutawidjaya** <a.h.sutawidjaya@mercubuana.ac.id>

Ahmad Hidayat Sutawidjaya:

Thank you for submitting the manuscript, "*Integrity of the Halal Supply Chain Conceptual Framework*" to INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF SUPPLY CHAIN MANAGEMENT.

With the online journal management system that we are using, you will be able to track its progress through the editorial process by logging in to the journal web site:

Submission URL: <https://ojs.excelingtech.co.uk/index.php/IJSCM/login>

Username: sutawidjaya

If you have any questions, please contact me. Thank you for considering this journal as a venue for your work.

Editor in Chief

[INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF SUPPLY CHAIN MANAGEMENT](#)

[IJSCM] Revision request**International Journal of Supply Chain Management** <mamunhabib@gmail.com>

Mon, May 18, 2020 at 11:32 AM

To: **Ahmad Hidayat Sutawidjaya** <a.h.sutawidjaya@mercubuana.ac.id>

Ahmad Hidayat Sutawidjaya:

The paper "*Integrity of the Halal Supply Chain Conceptual Framework*" has been preliminarily reviewed.

Reviewers have given their comments on your paper. Please do the following when you resubmit your revised version:

- (i) All corrections as per the reviewers' comments and prepare a table / response letter showing corrections done. Your corrections will not be accepted in the absence of this response letter / table.
- (ii) All authors' names, emails and affiliations checked and corrected.

Please ensure the submission of the revision within 1 month of receiving this mail either both as a reply to this mail and in the online system.

The paper can be resubmitted for a review after huge improvements, and this does not guarantee it will be approved.

If you have any questions, please contact me. Thank you for considering this journal as a venue for your work.

Editor in Chief

INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF SUPPLY CHAIN MANAGEMENT**Reviewer A**

The article is related to the topic of halal supply chains in the catering industry and presents an overview of the research objectives. The article is well written. Here are some suggestions for authors.

1. The abstract starts with a clear statement about the development of halal as a lifestyle for many Muslims, which is engaging and relevant to the topic. However, the abstract lacks a structured format. It would be beneficial to organize the abstract into distinct sections to provide a more systematic overview of the study.
2. The study briefly mentions the objective of the research, which is to create a new paradigm in the halal supply chain in the catering industry. However, it could benefit from a more detailed explanation of the specific goals or questions that the research aims to address.
3. The literature review introduces the concept of halal supply chain management, which is appropriate given the study's focus. It highlights the importance of ensuring that halal standards are met in the supply chain. However, the connection to the catering industry could be made more explicit.
4. The article mentions that the research focuses only on "Diamond" catering companies in Jakarta. While this indicates the scope, it would be helpful to briefly explain why this specific company was chosen and whether the findings can be generalized to the broader catering industry.
5. The reference to the Pew Research Center study is useful for providing context about the Muslim population's growth. However, the article could expand on this information to show

how it directly relates to the research on halal supply chains in catering.

Reviewer B

While the manuscript provides a general introduction to the research topic, it should also maintain a clear structure to make it easier for readers to understand the main points. Additionally, the revision of the following key areas would enhance clarity.

1. While the article highlights the importance of ensuring halal compliance in catering, it doesn't clearly state why this research is significant or what practical implications it may have for the industry.
2. The literature review section begins by defining supply chain management (SCM), which is a standard practice in academic writing. However, the definitions provided are somewhat standard and do not add a new dimension to the discussion. It would be beneficial to delve deeper into the concept of SCM or to provide specific examples of how it's relevant to the research.
3. The Research Design section appropriately describes the research design as "descriptive qualitative." It references an academic source to support this choice, which adds credibility to the methodology. The section provides a concise explanation of qualitative research, its philosophy, and its characteristics. However, it could benefit from a more direct statement of why a qualitative approach was chosen for this specific research.
4. The discussion section provides a reasonable discussion on the dimensions of food quality, distinguishing between objective and subjective elements. However, the connection to the overall research context could be made more explicit. How do these dimensions relate to halal supply chains in catering? The text should provide a clearer link.
5. The distinction between purity and quality is relevant to halal products, but the text could provide specific examples or cases to illustrate the thin line between the two. This would make the discussion more concrete and relatable to the reader.

[IJSCM] Revision Submission Acknowledgement**International Journal of Supply Chain Management** <mamunhabib@gmail.com>

Sun, Jun 14, 2020 at 2:43 PM

To: **Ahmad Hidayat Sutawidjaya** <a.h.sutawidjaya@mercubuana.ac.id>

Ahmad Hidayat Sutawidjaya:

Thank you for submitting revision of the manuscript, "*Integrity of the Halal Supply Chain Conceptual Framework*" to INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF SUPPLY CHAIN MANAGEMENT.

With the online journal management system that we are using, you will be able to track its progress through the editorial process by logging in to the journal web site:

Submission URL: <https://ojs.excelingtech.co.uk/index.php/IJSCM/login>

Username: sutawidjaya

If you have any questions, please contact me. Thank you for considering this journal as a venue for your work.

Editor in Chief

INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF SUPPLY CHAIN MANAGEMENT

Response to Reviewer 1

Sr. No.	Reviewer's Comment	Response
	The article is related to the topic of halal supply chains in the catering industry and presents an overview of the research objectives. The article is well written. Here are some suggestions for authors.	Thank you for your feedback on the paper.
1	The abstract starts with a clear statement about the development of halal as a lifestyle for many Muslims, which is engaging and relevant to the topic. However, the abstract lacks a structured format. It would be beneficial to organize the abstract into distinct sections to provide a more systematic overview of the study.	Dear reviewer, done as suggested. Please see page 1
2	The study briefly mentions the objective of the research, which is to create a new paradigm in the halal supply chain in the catering industry. However, it could benefit from a more detailed explanation of the specific goals or questions that the research aims to address.	Many thanks dear reviewer. Done as suggested. Please see page 3-4
3	The literature review introduces the concept of halal supply chain management, which is appropriate given the study's focus. It highlights the importance of ensuring that halal standards are met in the supply chain. However, the connection to the catering industry could be made more explicit.	Dear reviewer, thank you. Done as suggested. Please see pages 5-12
4	The article mentions that the research focuses only on "Diamond" catering companies in Jakarta. While this indicates the scope, it would be helpful to briefly	Dear reviewer, Thank you. Done as suggested. Please see pages 16-18

	explain why this specific company was chosen and whether the findings can be generalized to the broader catering industry.	
5	The reference to the Pew Research Center study is useful for providing context about the Muslim population's growth. However, the article could expand on this information to show how it directly relates to the research on halal supply chains in catering.	Dear reviewer, Thank you. Done as suggested. Please see page 14

Response to Reviewer 2

Sr. No.	Reviewer's Comment	Response
	While the manuscript provides a general introduction to the research topic, it should also maintain a clear structure to make it easier for readers to understand the main points. Additionally, the revision of the following key areas would enhance clarity.	Many thanks respected reviewer for your kind remarks and suggestions.
1	While the article highlights the importance of ensuring halal compliance in catering, it doesn't clearly state why this research is significant or what practical implications it may have for the industry.	Many thanks for your kind suggestions. Done as suggested. Please see pages 1, 4 and 19-20
2	The literature review section begins by defining supply chain management (SCM), which is a standard practice in academic writing. However, the definitions provided are somewhat standard and do not add a new dimension to the discussion. It would be beneficial to delve deeper into the concept of SCM or to provide specific examples of how it's relevant to the research.	Dear reviewer, following your kind guidelines. Done as suggested. Please see pages 5-12
3	The Research Design section appropriately describes the research design as "descriptive qualitative." It references an academic source to support this choice, which adds credibility to the methodology. The section provides a concise explanation of qualitative research, its philosophy, and its characteristics. However, it could benefit from a more direct statement of why a qualitative approach was chosen for this	Dear reviewer, Thank you for your kind suggestions. Done as suggested. Please see pages 13-14

	specific research.	
4	The discussion section provides a reasonable discussion on the dimensions of food quality, distinguishing between objective and subjective elements. However, the connection to the overall research context could be made more explicit. How do these dimensions relate to halal supply chains in catering? The text should provide a clearer link.	Respected reviewer, Thank you. Done as suggested. Please see pages 18-22
5	The distinction between purity and quality is relevant to halal products, but the text could provide specific examples or cases to illustrate the thin line between the two. This would make the discussion more concrete and relatable to the reader.	Thank you, dear reviewer. Done as suggested. Plesae see page 19

[IJSCM] Revision request**International Journal of Supply Chain Management** <mamunhabib@gmail.com>

Sat, Jul 04, 2020 at 11:57 AM

To: **Ahmad Hidayat Sutawidjaya** <a.h.sutawidjaya@mercubuana.ac.id>

Ahmad Hidayat Sutawidjaya:

The paper "*Integrity of the Halal Supply Chain Conceptual Framework*" has been reviewed again.

The revised version is of good quality and worth publishing with the following minor revisions.

1. The mention of the quality of resources and its impact on halal food is important. However, this section lacks specific examples or sources to support the claims made. Incorporating examples or real-life cases would strengthen the argument.
2. This part discusses the food production process and the importance of certification, especially in the Indonesian context. While it provides some context, the text should elaborate on how these factors influence the catering industry's supply chain and halal standards more specifically.
3. The conclusion is somewhat abrupt, and the text could benefit from a structured summary of the key points discussed in the paper. This would provide a clearer and more organized wrap-up.

Please ensure the submission of the revision within 1 month of receiving this mail either both as a reply to this mail and in the online system.

The paper can be resubmitted for a review after huge improvements, and this does not guarantee it will be approved.

If you have any questions, please contact me. Thank you for considering this journal as a venue for your work.

Editor in Chief

[INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF SUPPLY CHAIN MANAGEMENT](#)

[IJSCM] Revision Submission Acknowledgement**International Journal of Supply Chain Management** <mamunhabib@gmail.com>

Sat, Jul 25, 2020 at 11:35 AM

To: **Ahmad Hidayat Sutawidjaya** <a.h.sutawidjaya@mercubuana.ac.id>

Ahmad Hidayat Sutawidjaya:

Thank you for submitting revision of the manuscript, "*Integrity of the Halal Supply Chain Conceptual Framework*" to INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF SUPPLY CHAIN MANAGEMENT.

With the online journal management system that we are using, you will be able to track its progress through the editorial process by logging in to the journal web site:

Submission URL: <https://ojs.excelingtech.co.uk/index.php/IJSCM/login>

Username: sutawidjaya

If you have any questions, please contact me. Thank you for considering this journal as a venue for your work.

Editor in Chief

INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF SUPPLY CHAIN MANAGEMENT

Response to Reviewers

Sr. No.	Reviewer's Comment	Response
	The revised version is of good quality and worth publishing with the following minor revisions.	Many thanks, Respected Reviewer, for your kind appreciation.
1	The mention of the quality of resources and its impact on halal food is important. However, this section lacks specific examples or sources to support the claims made. Incorporating examples or real-life cases would strengthen the argument.	Many thanks for your kind comments. Done as suggested. Please see pages 11-13
2	This part discusses the food production process and the importance of certification, especially in the Indonesian context. While it provides some context, the text should elaborate on how these factors influence the catering industry's supply chain and halal standards more specifically.	Many thanks for your kind comments. Done as suggested. Please see pages 20-23
3	The conclusion is somewhat abrupt, and the text could benefit from a structured summary of the key points discussed in the paper. This would provide a clearer and more organized wrap-up.	Many thanks for your kind comments. Done as suggested. Please see pages 23-24

[IJSCM] Acceptance Acknowledgment

International Journal of Supply Chain Management <mamunhabib@gmail.com>

Mon, Aug 10, 2020 at 1:13 PM

To: **Ahmad Hidayat Sutawidjaya** <a.h.sutawidjaya@mercubuana.ac.id>

Ahmad Hidayat Sutawidjaya:

Congratulations!

Your paper entitled, "*Integrity of the Halal Supply Chain Conceptual Framework*" has been accepted for publication in INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF SUPPLY CHAIN MANAGEMENT (Vol. 9 No. 4, 2020).

Thank you for your interest in our journal. Your Journal paper would be indexed in Scopus (Elsevier), Google Scholar, Scirus, GetCited, Scribd, so on. We look forward to receiving your subsequent research papers.

Editor in Chief

[INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF SUPPLY CHAIN MANAGEMENT](#)